HUNTSVILLE HISTORICAL PRESERVATION COMMISSION

MINUTES

### October 10, 2016

The Huntsville Historic Preservation Commission met in the Conference Room on the 1st Floor of the Public Service Building located at 320 Fountain Circle on October 10, 2016. The members present were:

 Mr. David Ely Ms. Katie Stamps

Mr. Mike Holbrook Mr. Peter Lowe

Mr. Randy Cunningham Mr. Dennis Madsen

Ms. Drenda King

Also present at the meeting was Ms. Jessica White, Historic Preservation Consultant and Sharon Mize, Recording Secretary. The meeting was called to order at 4:30 p.m. by Mr. David Ely, Chairman. He read the preamble and introduced the Commission members.

**507 Adams Street – Mr. Larry Covington for Bruce & Sandy Ables**

Mr. Covington came before the Commission to request replacing the French doors on the back of the house with a wood door with true divided lights. The doors will be the same color as the existing doors. Mr. Holbrook made the motion to approve replacing the French doors and Mr. Madsen seconded the motion. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the motion.

**1214 Ward Avenue – Mr. Blake Mullins**

There was no one present to discuss this application. This application was denied.

Mr. Ely stepped down from the Commission to present the next application. Mr. Holbrook chaired the meeting for the next application.

**905 Clinton Avenue – Mr. David Ely for Ms. Patricia Edwards**

Mr. Ely said Ms. Edwards would like to remove the existing wood porch on the back of the house and replace it with a new wood porch with a roof. Mr. Ely said they would like to have the option of using either a metal seam roof or an asphalt shingle roof. If they use the metal seam roof it will be Colonial Red in color. The roof is a hip roof that ties unto the house. Mr. Madsen made the motion to approve removing the back porch and replacing with a new wood porch with their choice of either a metal roof or an asphalt roof. Ms. King seconded the motion and the Commission voted unanimously to approve.

Mr. Ely returned to the position of Chairman for the rest of the meeting.

**425 Locust Avenue – Mr. Marc Goldmon of Matheny Goldmon Architects & Interiors for Brendan & Karen Kelly**

Mr. Goldmon said the Kellys would like to replace the windows and replace a side window with a door on their home. This request includes replacing all of the windows with Marvin wood insulated windows. The windows in the laundry room and the bathroom will shift down. The three windows in the kitchen will change in size slightly. One window on the side will be changed out with a door.

Mr. Ely said he did not see anything wrong with the existing windows and they could add a storm sash to each window for insulation and better value. Mrs. Kelly said many of the windows don’t work or do not lock. The former owners put some tacky locks on the windows. She said it is a fire hazard to have windows that do not open. Mr. Ely said they could be made operable again without much effort. Mr. Holbrook said making a window operable requires removing the window and cleaning it and sometimes adding new hardware. It would be more cost efficient and more thermal efficient than new windows.

Mr. Lowe asked if the Commission preferred aluminum storm windows; but he would prefer wood storm windows. Mr. Holbrook said aluminum storm windows would be better than replacing the windows. He asked if they had a sample of the Marvin window they propose to use. Mr. Goldmon said it is the typical historic style window Marvin makes which is similar in size. Mr. Ely said it has a wider muntin bar than the existing windows. The aluminum window has a divided light which is 5/8” wide and is closer to the original window.

Mr. Ely said he is having a hard time allowing them to replace all the windows because they are the original windows and are in good condition. Mrs. Kelly said that was not necessarily so because some of the windows leak, some are difficult to open or will not open, and some of them have tacky looking locks. Mr. Ely said he has windows at his own house that he had to rework and kept them and they are better than new windows. Ms. White said she has names and phone numbers of window repair contractors.

Mr. Holbrook asked what change rendered this structure non-contributing and Ms. White said it was when the front porch was changed from a small portico to a massive front porch in 1997. Mr. Lowe asked if the property is considered non-contributing then why they aren’t allowed to put the new windows in. Mr. Ely said because at some point the property could age back in.

Mr. Lowe made the motion to approve the application as submitted including changing out the windows. Mrs. Kelly said the door they want to put on the side was originally an exterior door on the house but was moved to the inside. Mr. Lowe said he made the motion because this is a non-contributing structure. There was no second to the motion.

Ms. Stamps made the motion to approve the addition of the side door and reconfiguring the kitchen windows with new wood windows. Mr. Madsen seconded the motion. Mr. Lowe abstained from the vote and the Commission voted unanimously to approve the motion.

**609 Adams Street – Mr. Frank Nola for Marshall & Garrett Schreeder**

Mr. Nola came before the Commission to request removing the rear porch and stairs, construct a porte cochere on the north side of the hours, raise the eave height at the rear of the house to construct a new kitchen and stair with stoop at the back of the house, and construct a new detached garage.

Mr. Nola said they would like to ask if they could have the option of a standing seam metal roof or asphalt shingles to match the house on the porte cochere. Mr. Lowe said he thought the shingles would look better. The eave height on the rear of the house will be raised to be the same as the original part of the house. The second story was added in the 1950’s and it is a low second story.

Mr. Ely asked if they were removing a chimney on the back. Mr. Nola said they will be losing a stove chimney that is just a 16 inch square chimney and is not ornamental in anyway and has been abandoned for a long time. After they remove the porch and stairs from the rear of the house the smoke house will be liberated. Mr. Ely said he thought the new garage would look better without the cupola on top.

Mr. Lowe made the motion to approve as submitted with the option to use asphalt shingles or a standing seam metal roof on the porte cochere. The garage will be sided with hardiboard. Mr. Madsen seconded the motion. Mr. Ely said he thought the garage needs to be plainer and Ms. Stamps agreed. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the application.

**415 Grayson Street – Mr. Lester Sutton**

Mr. Sutton has already completed the work at this house and is asking for permission after the fact. He explained he is new to the historic district and was not told until after he had started the work that the house was located in the district. A Stop Work Order was placed on the property. Concrete was poured over the existing porch floor, a new roof put on a shed, the sidewalk was made higher and steps added, and a concrete patio was cleaned and stained, and a new driveway was installed.

Mr. Sutton said the stamped concrete was already existing and they pressure washed it and re-stained it. He said they fixed the gutters and replaced the roof and repaired the fence and painted it. He purchased the house for his daughter and after she had been living there a while she found that water was standing on the front porch every time it rained. The inspector told them the front wall of the house was damp and had been repaired due to rot and termite damage. After further investigation they found there was also water standing underneath the house. The water was running off of the porch and into the crawl space. They poured 2 ½ inches of concrete on top of the porch to keep the water from standing on the porch and running into the crawl space.

The previous driveway was part concrete, asphalt and a little bit of everything else. The driveway was in bad shape so they poured a new concrete driveway to help the water runoff go into the storm drain. Since they have done all of this work they have not had any more problems with water damage. When he purchased the house in January all the roof and fence repairs were a part of the contract. No one told them they were in a historic district.

Mr. Ely said there is a problem with pouring concrete on the city right of way. Mr. Sutton said it was concrete before. Ms. White corrected him and said it was asphalt and concrete. Mr. Holbrook said besides doing the work without a COA, he saw several things of concern. He said none of the steps meet code. Mr. Sutton said the steps were existing and they just added concrete on top of them.

Mr. Cunningham said the steps do not need a railing because there are only two risers. He said they actually put a stop work order on this job before the concrete was poured because it was in the right of way and because they did not have a COA to do the work. Mr. Sutton said it was poured before the Stop Work Order was issued. Ms. White said she went out to the house the day the complaint was made and the concrete had not been poured.

Mr. Lowe made the motion to approve everything except the portion which violates City ordinances. Mr. Cunningham said the Engineering Department handles right of way problems and they determine if there are any issues. Mr. Lowe said the Engineering Department can come out and look at the right of way and could even have them tear it out. Mr. Sutton said the real estate agent should have advised him of the rules in the historic district.

Ms. King seconded the motion. The Commission voted with Mr. Madsen, Mr. Cunningham, Mr. Holbrook and Mr. Ely voting against the motion. The motion was denied. Mr. Ely asked Mr. Cunningham to get Engineering involved. Mr. Ely said he could not see any of the work done to be historically damaging to the house but he is also in a quandary with water flowing down from the street damaging his property.

Mr. Madsen said the work done on the property has minimal impact on the property. However, it isn’t a good idea for homeowners to take it upon themselves to handle the drainage issues on the street, especially on the right of way. Mr. Madsen made the motion to approve the work which was done within the property line, but not the work done in the right of way. Mr. Sutton needs to meet with the City Engineering Department regarding the concrete poured in the right of way. Mr. Lowe seconded the motion and the Commission voted unanimously to approve the motion.

**502 Clinton Avenue – Ms. Janet Foley**

Ms. Foley requested erecting a wood fence in her back yard, six feet in height and stained black. The fence will have a gate which slides open with an eight foot opening. Mr. Ely asked if it will be placed on a brick or rock fence. Ms. Foley said it is just a wood fence with sliding gates in the middle. Mr. Lowe made the motion to approve erecting the fence and Ms. Stamps seconded the motion. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the new fence.

**308 Eustis Avenue – Mr. Ken Mease for Mr. Carter Stockton**

This application requested the addition of a dormer in the attic to provide an egress window. The window will be located behind the chimney and will not be very visible from the street. The space will be used for storage and a bonus room. The dormer will be made of smooth hardiboard with five inch exposure painted to match the existing house; and the roof on the dormer will be a standing seam metal roof in the color of slate. Mr. Ely said he did not think they would need to mimic the arches in the window.

Ms. Stamps made the motion to approve the addition of the dormer and Mr. Lowe seconded the motion.

Mr. Holbrook asked why they are using standing seam instead of architectural shingles. Mr. Mease said the pitch of the dormer is too low for architectural shingles. Mr. Ely suggested they could use a flat lock roof. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the motion.

**1002 McCullough Avenue – Ms. Angela Lucas**

Mrs. Lucas came before the Commission requesting to paint her house and shed in the colors of Sherwin Williams Cabbage Rose for the siding, Classical White for the trim and shutters, Billiard Green for the steps, door and skirt below siding. Mr. Lowe made the motion to approve the paint colors and Ms. Stamps seconded the motion. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the paint colors.

**205 Dement Street – Mr. Jon Mash & Ms. Lauren Lovell**

This application requested repairing the wood siding, paint the siding, add a side stoop, and erect a garage. There is an existing side entry door but there is no roof over it. The paint color will be PPG Azalea Leaf.

The proposed garage door will face the alley. The fence and driveway are existing as well. The garage will be shorter than the house. The siding will be hardiplank with the same exposure as the house. He would like to have the option of using smooth hardiplank instead of the shake hardiplank on the top of the garage due to cost.

Ms. White asked they use a paint color for the shutters instead of a stain color. Mr. Mash said they will come up with a color to match the shutter color as the stain.

Mr. Lowe made the motion to approve repairing the siding and painting the house; erect a garage as presented with the option of using smooth hardiplank; and add a stoop to the side door; meet with Ms. White for the paint color on the shutters. Mr. Holbrook seconded the motion and the Commission voted unanimously to approve the motion.

**1214 Ward Avenue – Mr. Blake Mullins**

There was no one present at the meeting to represent the application. This application was denied.

**Old Business:**

Ms. Stamps made the motion to approve the minutes from the September 12th meeting. Mr. Madsen seconded the motion and the Commission voted unanimously to approve the minutes.

Ms. White said she made two presentations this past week: one at CSI and one at A&M University. She said she would like for others to get involved in helping share the word of preservation. There was some interest in doing another window repair workshop. Mr. Ely said he had a neighbor inquire about a workshop as well.

There was a reminder of the Cemetery Stroll will be this Sunday.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

 Dennis Madsen

 Manager of Urban and Long Range

 Planning